

Appendix 3 - Alternative options to closure of the small group and individual instrument teaching by East Sussex Music – Advantages and disadvantages

1. Award of a concession contract

With this model, staff would transfer to the organisation awarded the concession contract on their current terms and conditions under TUPE arrangements. Consultation on any proposed new structures (if relevant) would take place prior to transfer.

The award of a concession contract would require a formal procurement process. The first step would be to issue a Prior Information Notice (PIN) to invite formal expressions of interest. This is a confidential process and so it is not appropriate to provide information about the organisation that has come forward with an informal expression of interest at this point.

A number of issues such as pension and redundancy liability would need to be addressed through the procurement process.

2. Hounslow / Croydon proposal

This proposal has been looked at in detail as it has been successfully implemented in Croydon. The model separates teaching roles into 2 roles:

- a lead teacher role, paid on the national teachers' terms and conditions at the upper pay range, which delivers whole class teaching, contributes to developing new offers for schools and delivers some small group and individual tuition
- an instrumental tutor role which delivers small group and individual tuition, paid on a local pay scale, mirroring the unqualified teachers' pay scale.

Advice on the legality of removing teachers' terms and conditions from the instrumental tutor role is not definitive and so would remain open to challenge.

The financial data used in the proposal is inaccurate as it included costs not associated with the direct delivery of instrumental tuition. The proposal has been costed based on current instrumental teaching hours and 8FTE Lead Teachers (rather than 10FTE costed in the original proposal) and uses the nearest equivalent on the Single Status scale to that used in the proposal for the instrumental tutor role (the top of SS9, with 2 weekend working increments for those staff to whom it would apply.) Costed in this way, the proposal would deliver savings of £51,765.

Due to the different way that hourly rates of pay are calculated on the teacher and Single Status pay scales, there would be a greater reduction in the salaries of hourly paid staff than contracted staff. Those not working at Saturday music centres would not receive the weekend working increments.

Implementing the model would require staff consultation, appointment to a limited number of lead teacher posts and appointment to instrumental tutor roles. Redundancy would be available for those not choosing to take up an instrumental tutor position.

An analysis of potential advantages and disadvantages of the two models is contained in the table below.

	Advantages	Disadvantages
Award of a concession contract	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Retains the instrumental teaching service, within a larger organisation • Potential savings through creating a single management and administration team, office base and database system • Some aspects of service delivery might be able to be delivered collaboratively, for example summer schools, delivering savings • A larger organisation would be more robust and more able to withstand any changes in income or cost • Likely to be acceptable to staff and unions as staff would retain their current terms and conditions • Organisations coming together could benefit from their relative strengths to improve the offer to children and young people 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The procurement process will take time and resource • There would be some significant issues to resolve, for example around pension and redundancy liabilities • There would be some loss of senior management and administration posts and possible compulsory redundancies • Bringing two cultures together can create challenges
Hounslow / Croydon proposal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Retains instrumental tuition within the service • Delivers savings through removing teachers' terms and conditions from the instrumental tutor role • Some teaching staff retain teachers' terms and conditions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Loss of teachers' terms and conditions might not be welcomed by staff and unions and risks legal challenge • Wide difference in salary between the two roles • The Single Status pay scale does not mirror the unqualified teachers' pay

scale: it has narrower pay bands for grades, treats term-time working as part-time and has differences in weekend working arrangements and the way hourly pay is calculated

- Drop in salary for many staff taking on instrumental tutor role and there would be no safeguarding of salary
- Potential loss of efficiency; previous restructure created a single job description so that teaching resource can be utilised with maximum efficiency
- Limiting whole class teaching to a smaller group of teaching staff delivering across a large rural county would require travel across greater distances, resulting in a loss of efficiency